

POLLOKSHIELDS HERITAGE

Honorary President: Sir John Maxwell Macdonald Bt

April 2017

Dear Pollokshields Heritage supporters,

It has been a busy year for Pollokshields Heritage so we thought it worth telling our members and supporters all about what we've been up to.

Pollokshields Heritage Lecture Series

Now into its 8th season the Lecture Series has continued through the winter and spring months of 2016 -17 with lectures on the following:

Tuesday, 15th November 2016 - *A Perfect Place to Play - Pollok Estate in the History of Sport* - Sports historian Ged O'Brien, founder of the world's first national museum of football and author of 'Played in Glasgow', took a look at the Pollok Estate from the unusual angle of sporting heritage. Ged looked at how the Stirling-Maxwell family ensured their place in the annals of sporting history, and in doing so, helped confirm Glasgow as the world capital of sport.

Tuesday, 17th January 2017 - *200 Years of Glasgow Botanic Gardens* - In celebration of its bi-centenary, Ewen Donaldson, Senior Manager of the Glasgow Botanic Gardens looked at the history of the Glasgow Botanic Gardens from its formation in 1817, including the development of its plant collections; its famous glasshouses and layout on the current Kelvinside site. The history of the Kibble Palace glasshouse and its recent restoration was also covered. The talk looked at the extensive plant collections with emphasis on the environmental education focus of the Gardens.

Tuesday, 21st February 2017 - *The Glasgow Citizens Theatre in the 21st Century* - Graham Sutherland, Head of Production at the Citizens Theatre, talked about the Citizens Theatre - one of Glasgow's most well-loved cultural institutions. Based in the Gorbals, it has enjoyed an extraordinary 138 years of entertaining Glasgow audiences and launched the careers of many of the UK's leading actors including Pierce Brosnan, Gary Oldman, David Hayman and recent Oscar winner, Mark Rylance. However, the Category 'B' list building is deteriorating and it is in poor physical condition, hampering the future ambitions of the organisation. A £20.8 million capital redevelopment project has been launched to restore and expand what is one of Scotland's oldest and most iconic working theatres. Graham focused on the building's unique heritage and the renovation of the splendid Victorian auditorium with its many original features, as well as Scotland's oldest and most complete surviving stage machinery and 19th century paint frames - elements of which are the only remaining examples of their kind in the world and which are still in use today. Graham's talk was followed a week later by a guided tour behind the scenes at the Citizens.

The talks have been well received with good Audience turnout.

There is still a further talk to go for our AGM:

Tuesday, 25th April 2017 - *The Tenement House* - Rachel Kacir, former Property Manager of the Tenement House (now at Glasgow City Heritage Trust) will give an illustrated talk providing a fascinating insight into life in Glasgow in the early 20th century. The talk will chart the history of tenements in the city, before focusing on the National Trust for Scotland's 'Tenement House'. This four room house in Garnethill was lived in by Miss Agnes Toward for over 50 years, from 1911 until 1965. It retains many of its original fixtures and fittings, including a cast-iron range and recess beds. Miss Toward didn't like to throw things out, so there is also a large collection of her personal belongings in the House, including books, textiles, costume jewellery, magazines and recipes. Rachel will show images of some of the most interesting items from the collection during the talk.

Ready Steady Grow and Doors Open Day 2016

As part of the 2016 Ready Steady Grow event Pollokshields Heritage took a stall in Maxwell Square so we were able to get our message out to interested local residents. For the 2016 Doors Open Day event we hosted two walking tours of both East and West Pollokshields, a walking tour of Dumbreck, and, due to popular demand, Bus Tours of the whole Garden Suburb on both the Saturday and the Sunday. All events were busy with good feedback. A total of 88 people attended the walks with 75 people on the bus tours.

Maxwell Park Station

Due to the problems of water ingress I reported last year, we haven't been able to use Maxwell Park Station for as many committee meetings as we normally would and this has resulted in additional expenditure for room hire elsewhere; however, the former booking office still serves as a base camp for our Doors Open Day walks and continues to act as a meeting HQ for a number of local amenity groups and the Pollokshields Ward Councillors. It has also been let for small exhibitions. So this is a reminder that it remains available on request!

The subgroup, which comprises John Thomson, Karin Currie, Ann Laing and Hilary Stanger, continues to liaise with the Railway Heritage Trust, ScotRail and Network Rail.

As well as tackling the water ingress this year our focus has been on the completion of the painting of the station building. It is more than a year since the building was part painted in the new Scotrail corporate colours so as our involvement in the station is part of the 'Adopt-a-Station' initiative we have been pursuing Network Rail and Scotrail throughout the year for confirmation that they do intend to finish as per their Listed Building Consent. This has been somewhat frustrating for the subgroup and appears to be tied up with the condition of the canopies; however, there has recently been movement on the repainting of the railway bridge connecting the station to Fotheringay Road and Terregles Avenue so that is good news.

The platform planters continue to be nurtured by our Head Gardener, Ann Laing with help from Karin Currie and John Thomson.

Progress on the Make your Mark East Pollokshields Charrette

Throughout 2016 Pollokshields Heritage has continued work with Pollokshields Community Council on the Make your Mark East Pollokshields Charrette including coordinating comments and feedback from the community on the first draft of the Charrette report which resulted in amendments and refinements to the final version of the report. We also assisted consultation with Glasgow City Council over the eventual adoption of the Charrette report as supplementary planning guidance to the new City Development Plan though this process has still to conclude. This included a joint presentation to the Glasgow Urban Design Panel with the consultant team Collective Architects and Dress for the Weather. So far the outcomes from the Charrette include being awarded a further £15,000 of Scottish Government monies from the 'Activating Ideas' Fund to take the ideas from the Charrette further and the establishment of the Pollokshields Trust – a community development trust which will facilitate and co-ordinate efforts by the community to improve Pollokshields and will seek out funding to this end.

Pollokshields Heritage's consultation response on Glasgow City Council's draft Historic Environment Supplementary Guidance

In mid-July 2016 Pollokshields Heritage prepared and submitted a detailed consultation response to the draft Historic Environment Supplementary Guidance that is to sit under Glasgow City Council's new City Development Plan which was adopted at the end of March 2017. We argued that as the text was largely reproduced from the previous DG/DES 3 Design Guidance for Listed Buildings and Properties in Conservation Areas that accompanied City Plan 2 the effectiveness of it had already been tested for at least eight years and, unfortunately, there was consensus amongst the Pollokshields Heritage committee, in response to concerns expressed by our members and the community, that the guidance was not working in the West Pollokshields and Dumbreck Conservation Areas and this was largely to do with the size, scale and style of proposed new extensions to Victorian and Edwardian villas within the garden suburb many of which display little grasp of the need for harmony if the suburb's sense of place is not to be undermined. We argued that the need for harmony was important and should be central to Placemaking within the garden suburbs. We suggested to Glasgow City Council that we would like to work with them on the commissioning and production of design guidelines for the neighbourhood like the successful guidelines produced in 2009 for the City of Pasadena in California as we felt this would provide much better guidance to applicants and their agents on what would work best in the garden suburbs. The final version of the Supplementary Guidance was to be published in November 2016 but has yet to appear and we have had no acknowledgement of our proposal from Glasgow City Council.

Pollokshields Heritage's involvement over the McCarthy and Stone planning application for Springkell Avenue

Pollokshields Heritage was heavily involved in pre-application consultations for the McCarthy and Stone proposed older person housing development on Springkell Avenue which, while not in either East or West Pollokshields Conservation Areas, was located on a key site which acts as a hinge between the two conservation areas and terminates Fotheringay Road. Our input resulted in significant changes to and refinement of the proposal to make it more sympathetic to the adjacent conservation area context. This included a change from a flat roof to a pitched roof; a revised material palette with the replacement of inappropriate white render and yellow brick for a more homogeneous sympathetic red brick that echoes a traditional Glasgow common brick; a reworked corner with feature chimney as vertical accent terminating the view down Fotheringay Road and echoing the chimneys that are a characteristic of both East and West Pollokshields Conservation Areas. Nevertheless, in our opinion these changes did not go far enough with concerns still being expressed over the impact on the residents of Springkell Gardens and neighbouring houses and use of questionable materials such as grey uPVC windows and zinc cladding which we felt were not appropriate for a new building addressing two conservation areas. Therefore, we

decided to object in order to put pressure on McCarthy & Stone to deliver a better development for the neighbourhood. In the end the zinc was substituted with a blue brick but the uPVC windows remain and planning permission was granted - something that was never in doubt given a use compatible with the surrounding residential area.

Pollokshields Heritage's objection to the Sauchiehall Street Student Housing development that risks obscuring the South Elevation of Charles Rennie Mackintosh's Glasgow School of Art

As members of the Glasgow Urban Design Panel we were surprised in September 2016 to see a presentation for a Student Housing Complex on the site of the former ABC Cinema on Sauchiehall Street which would abut the south gable, obscure views to and from the south elevation, while simultaneously impinging on daylighting levels in the south facing top-lit studios of Charles Rennie Mackintosh's Glasgow School of Art. To our minds this market driven proposal was over-dominant in terms of massing and would damage the setting of the Glasgow Art School – one of Glasgow's crowning architectural and cultural achievements and a potential World Heritage Site. The south elevation of the Glasgow School of Art is particularly notable for the influence Mackintosh took from Scotland's tower house tradition. As with the other elevations of the Glasgow School of Art, it is particularly fascinating to see how Mackintosh's style develops as he matures as an architect. The south elevation has an important role to play in this story. It visibly charts the evolution of this aspect of his style, ranging from the simple south gable to the east wing of 1897-9... to the highly sophisticated spatial interplay of solids... and to the oriel bay voids which Mackintosh incises into the south gable of the west wing of 1907-9, in order to supply daylight to the studios and the library. Just as importantly for Glasgow's heritage tourism economy, the south elevation is also the first glimpse many visitors to the city see of the Glasgow School of Art. To our minds, a proposal that risks obscuring this key part of Mackintosh's oeuvre is simply unacceptable. Therefore, Pollokshields Heritage decided to object and, despite a recommendation from the Planning Officer, we're pleased to see the Planning Applications Committee agree to a Hearing – the first in Glasgow in a long time, but worth it for this exceptional case. We await the results of the hearing.

Pollokshields Heritage's involvement over the development of the key Gasworks site on Maxwell Road

Our pre-application consultation experience was later put to good use on proposals for the large Gasworks site opposite 129 Maxwell Road. This key site had been highlighted in the charrette report for its importance in helping to overcome severance between East Pollokshields, Port Eglinton and the Eglinton Street corridor that connects the Southside to the city centre. Therefore, we were keen for a good scheme so co-ordinated with the developer AS Homes on publicising the pre-application exhibition held in Tramway on 8 November 2016. Unfortunately, the scheme they unveiled was very disappointing with a single cul-de-sac serving 140 houses and tenement flats and a layout that could have been designed in the mid-1980s. A detailed formal response was prepared for this in conjunction with other community groups and interested local architects all of whom had been quite critical of the lack of character in the scheme chiefly that it did not take its cue from the neighbouring garden suburb – an obvious exemplar. It would appear this touched a nerve resulting in the abandonment of this initial scheme, the recruitment of an architect and the tabling of a significantly improved scheme at a community meeting on 24 November 2016. The revised layout suggested more potential to be a better example of placemaking than the original cul-de-sac scheme and one that would better adhere to Scottish Government policy set out in *Designing Streets* and the supplementary planning guidance set out in Glasgow City Council's Design Guide for New Residential Areas. Nevertheless, the developer was anxious to submit a rushed planning application as soon as the legal pre-application consultation period had concluded on Christmas Eve. Though we met with AS Homes planning consultant just prior to this and urged them to delay the submission until after the Christmas holidays to continue design development our plea fell on deaf ears. Therefore, we were faced with no choice but to object to unresolved aspects of the scheme (including a park we thought unsafe for children's play as it was not well overlooked) though we broadly welcomed the residential development of this large brownfield site. In the interim the design has been through two further revisions which have addressed several our concerns. We anticipate planning consent being granted shortly; however, it was good to see a developer ultimately being responsive to community concerns.

Pollokshields Heritage's involvement in a Major Planning Enforcement issue in the West Pollokshields Conservation Area

Another issue that has been vexing us over the last 18 months has been the extent of large scale unauthorised works that have taken place to a villa in 57 Hamilton Avenue that lies within the West Pollokshields Conservation Area. Though the owner received consent in December 2012 for a two-storey extension and large garage what has been built varies significantly from this. As well as the rear garage and side extension being larger than what was consented the owner's contractor then dug out the villa's front garden to install a large retaining wall in front of which he built a very large garage with roof terrace tucked behind the front boundary hedge. It remains the most serious, significant, ongoing and unacceptable breach of planning consent we have come across in the West Pollokshields Conservation Area let alone Glasgow. Despite interventions from enforcement officers and stop notices being served the owner of the villa only finally got around to submitting a Retrospective Planning Application in October 2016 which was not validated until 21 December 2016 though it did not appear on the Council's Planning Portal until 24 January 2017. Pollokshields Heritage, in conjunction with Pollokshields Community Council and surrounding neighbours, objected in the strongest possible terms with a lengthy representation explaining how this breached Glasgow City Council's planning policies and the Scottish Government's Planning Circular 10/2009: Planning Enforcement. It has been a relief to discover the refusal of the application in late March 2017 though we await a copy of the planning officer's handling report and we are conscious that the owner will inevitably appeal so this could be just one stage in a longer battle.

Pollokshields Heritage's consultation response to a proposal to delist an East Pollokshields tenement

In mid-January, we were surprised to discover that Historic Environment Scotland were holding a consultation on a proposal to de-list a 'B' listed tenement at 336 - 362 (even nos) Maxwell Road & 459 Shields Road – a tenement in the poorest Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation datazone in Pollokshields and one of the first tenements to be constructed in East Pollokshields. Admittedly, the tenement is not in good condition but it does have some design merit so this completely caught us unaware – no one knew HES could do this. It turned out that it had been requested by a member of the public so HES had no choice under their procedures but to respond. Working quickly, we used HES's own somewhat perfunctory handling report on the building to draw up a detailed analysis showing how this was the first tenement in Pollokshields to have bay windows and how the unusual design for the bay windows with a two-storey chamfered bay sitting over a square bay base had come from the 'A' listed 1-6 Park Gardens by Charles Wilson while other motifs were derived from a now demolished building in Kingston by Alexander 'Greek' Thomson. We concluded that the tenement, with its sophisticated elevation might be by Charles Wilson's assistant David Thomson who lived just around the corner on Nithsdale Road, taught at the Glasgow School of Art and after Alexander 'Greek' Thomson's death went into partnership with Robert Turnbull. We were also able to supply information on the first residents of the tenement. Unfortunately, though HES amended their handling report to take cognisance of this additional information they felt that the building, which now has a concrete tile roof and multiple uPVC windows, has been so altered as to negate its listed status. This is a disappointing outcome and we have made clear to HES we do not agree with it and expressed concern that rather than tackling issues such as uPVC windows – which are reversible and a sign of fuel poverty – HES are taking the easy route instead. We have advised that by doing so there is a perception of HES appearing, in effect, to be penalising owners in an area suffering multiple deprivations for not having the funding and capacity to properly maintain their built heritage as HES sees fit and this risks undermining all the good work that came out of the Charrette. We have subsequently met HES to discuss this and are hopeful of them hosting a Built Heritage event in Pollokshields as part of the Year of History, Heritage and Archaeology in 2017 so that something good comes out of this.

Update on the Mackintosh Organ from Craigie Hall – where is it now?

Some of you may recall the campaign we led two years ago, over a proposal to remove Charles Rennie Mackintosh's Organ from the Music Room at the 'A' listed Craigie Hall. Though we lost that campaign we were at least reassured that the Organ would be in public ownership with Glasgow Life and would be restored and re-erected in a replica of the Music Room in the new Kelvin Hall. Unfortunately, a journalist who was in touch last week revealed that, rather than being restored to its former glory in time for the 150th Anniversary of Charles Rennie Mackintosh's birth in 2018, the Organ is languishing in 300 pieces in a storage unit in Glasgow. It's a most depressing outcome for one of the jewels in Glasgow's crown and something that could have been the centrepiece of the celebrations. We hope this revelation, which has now been published in the Mail on Sunday and the Herald, will give pause to those charged with protecting the city's cultural assets and they think again.

The Committee

I want to take this opportunity to thank the committee members for their support - Iain Dyer as deputy chair, Hilary Stanger our treasurer who does an excellent job dealing with OSCR, Janet Brand our secretary, John Thomson both as minute secretary and for his work at Maxwell Park Station, Ann Laing for being our head gardener at the station and representative on the South Area Committee, David Hart for his work on the website and the Census information from 1861 - 1911 being placed on our website with assistance from Roger Millar thanks to a participatory budgeting from Glasgow City Council, Roger Millar for being our new representative on the Glasgow Urban Design Panel, Elizabeth Jarvis for organising the Lecture Series. Alison Taylor for her work as events co-ordinator and Helen Barnard our planning convener assisted by Helen Millar. I also want to thank Colin Davis who, through pressure of work, resigned from the committee during the course of the year but who encouraged us to think more strategically about the direction and purpose of Pollokshields Heritage and whose input was very much appreciated. We are, as ever, on the look out for new committee members to build our expertise and to help protect the legacy and amenity of the three conservation areas.

Finally, but by no means least, a big thank you to you, our members, without whom Pollokshields Heritage could not continue to flourish. With your continued support, here's to another busy year.

Kindest regards.

Yours sincerely,

Niall Murphy
Chair, Pollokshields Heritage